

Please note confidential and commercially sensitive information has been redacted from these minutes.

Key abbreviations/acronyms used in these Minutes:

HEFCE	Higher Education Funding Council for England
SMT	Strategic Management Team
NSS	National Student Survey
LJMU	Liverpool John Moores University
QAA	Quality Assurance Agency
HESA	Higher Education Statistics Agency
SLC	Student Loans Company
TEF	Teaching Excellence Framework
ERDF	European Regional Development Fund
REF	Research Excellence Framework
CUG	Complete University Guide
SSR	Staff Student Ratio

Date: Monday 21st November 2016

Venue: Roscoe Room

Present: Mr R Hill (Chair)
Ms N Benson (Deputy Chair)
Mrs K Byrne (Chair, Finance Committee)
Miss A Davis
Mr P Holme (Chair, Employment Committee)
Mr A Holroyd
Miss S Jette-Gray
Ms M Laing
Ms S Maclennan
Sir B Massie (Chair, Audit Committee)
Mr B McCann
Mr J Rowan
Mr J Stopforth
Mr J Trantom
Mr E Ward
Professor N Weatherill (Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive)
Mr C Williams
Ms W Williams
Mr I Wroot

Apologies: Ms K McCormick

In attendance: Professor A Al-Shamma'a (Executive Dean, Faculty of Engineering & Technology)
Mr M Askem (Associate Director, Estate Management) (Item 11 only)

Ms J Bertolini (Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive
 Professor P Byers (Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Education))
 Mr T Dray (Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement) (Item 18 only)
 Mr G Graham (Deputy Chief Executive, Organisational Enhancement)
 Dr E Harcourt (Pro-Vice-Chancellor (External Engagement))
 Professor R Leatherbarrow (Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Scholarship, Research & Knowledge Transfer)
 Mr M Power (Registrar & Deputy Chief Executive)
 Dr C Robson (Director of Strategic Planning)
 Ms D Tipping (Deputy Clerk to the Board, Minutes)
 Professor P Vickerman (Strategic Initiatives & Enhancement Executive Director)
 Professor P Wheeler (Executive Dean, Faculty of Science)
 Ms E Williams (Head of Academic Quality Services) (Item 8 (i) only)
 Professor J Yates (Executive Dean, Faculty of Arts, Professional and Social Studies).

Declaration of Interests:

No declared interests reported.

Bribery Act:

Governors were reminded of their ongoing commitment to the requirements of the Bribery Act 2010.

PRELIMINARY FORMAL BUSINESS

LJMU 16.56

Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the meeting held on Thursday 29th September 2016 (LJMU 16/053) were agreed as an accurate record of the meeting.

Approved.

LJMU 16.57

Matters Arising Not Covered on the Agenda

- All matters arising are covered as separate agenda items.
- The annual reports of the Board's sub-committees will be circulated in the near future.
- The Nominations Committee had considered the invitation for a member of the Board to also become a member of the student union's Trustee Board. After further consideration it was agreed that this would not be in the best interests of the University or the

Students' Union, and in particular there could be a conflict of interest in the context of funding from the University to the Students' Union.

- It was also noted that the Board of Governors had representation from two student governors on the Board.

Noted.

LJMU 16.58 **Board Level Authorisation**

Received: The report on the use of the University Seal and Board Level Authorisation (LJMU 16/054).

Commented: • The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive informed the Board that the University has negotiated an agreement that formalises a student-centred partnership with Liverpool Cathedral which freezes the facilities costs of graduation over a ten-year term.

Noted.

ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

Secretary's Note: **[The Chair informed the Board, with their agreement, that item 18 on the agenda would be discussed at this point to allow the presenter to leave the meeting after the item]**

LJMU 16.59 **Report of LJMU Graduate Destinations 2016 – Academic Year 2014/15**

Received: The report of the Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement (LJMU 16/072)

Reported: • The report provided a summary of the graduate destinations 2016 for the academic year 2014/15. The annual survey is the major means by which feedback about the first career destinations of graduates is obtained and benchmarking against the sector facilitated.

• 'All LJMU graduates' include UK, EU and international students who studied full-time, part-time, undergraduate and postgraduate courses. The performance of this cohort is typically better than for UK, full-time, first degree graduates for reasons including: part-time students often possess greater levels of general and vocational maturity, they may have been in work (many in professional and managerial jobs) whilst studying and stayed with the

employer or got a new job, a postgraduate qualification making an individual more employable.

- 'Graduate Prospects' of UK, full-time, first degree graduates is the cohort generally used by the league tables. Because 'Graduate Prospects' combines employment in professional and managerial jobs and graduate level postgraduate study the number of graduates entering each of these destinations is important. While the number of LJMU graduates entering professional and managerial jobs has increased, postgraduate study has in the past few years fallen, but increased in 2015 and this year. Universities with which the University is compared in league tables have higher numbers of graduates entering postgraduate study and this positively affects their 'Graduate Prospects' rate, for example, Russell Group universities with rates typically above 30% and the UK sector average typically around 12%.
- The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement was pleased to report that the general direction of travel for 'All LJMU Graduate First Destinations' (up by 2.4%) and for 'LJMU UK, full-time, first degree Graduate First Destinations' (up by 3.6%) is positive. However, the University will continue to work towards making further improvements to ensure it compares favourably with its competitors.
- Some targeted plans have now been put in place for more tailored and bespoke careers guidance, advice and training across the Faculties and Schools, also taking into account gender, ethnicity and social background. More work is being done specifically through the career zones that have been established throughout the University, offering career development support where and when students want it, with the option to develop further pop-up career zones.
- The University has also established a 'Careers Zone 24/7: Online careers provision which provides a range of digital careers tools available to students to enable them to work on vitally important employability and transition skills at their own pace, in their own time, both on or off campus to help students prepare for the jobs market.
- Students also now have access to the Indeed job site which allows students to search millions of jobs, in over 50 countries, from thousands of job sites, newspapers, recruiters and company career sites.

- The University now offers current second and final year students the opportunity to undertake a 20-day internship with a local organisation working on a suitable project or piece of work to enhance their employability.
- The World of Work Careers Centre is also assessing, through an on-line questionnaire, the career readiness of students, asking questions around the type of career they are working towards and how to find the appropriate help and create their own professional digital profile.
- The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement is awaiting the outcome of the 'HESA consultation to help determine what should replace the current Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education survey' which will assist in establishing new actions in the future.

Commented:

- Governors asked whether the World of Work Skills Certificate remains relevant and whether this should be reviewed. The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement informed the Board that it is now timely to review the scheme and that the recent quinquennial review had helped to crystalize some of the thinking around that in the context of a more nuanced, bespoke service going forward, rather than the World of Skills Certificate in its current format which is one size fits all.
- Governors noted the report contained a lot of statistical information and would have felt it more helpful if there was some further written context in relation to the comparisons for graduate employment with the University's competitors. Governors suggested that this should be included in future reports in addition to a clear plan as to how the University is to achieve significant improvement in this area.

Action:

Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement

- The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement informed the Board that there is some complexity in the answer to the question as to why the University is not performing as well in the professional management market as some of its peers. Some of the reasons are around the nature of the courses in the context of many LJMU students embarking on portfolio careers which would not register under the professional or managerial category, and other areas where a first degree

did not always equip students to go into their chosen career and who therefore go on to further study.

- Further discussion took place regarding those who graduated in particular areas, such as zoology, and whether the University is widening its career advice to such students with consideration to be given as to how their skills would fit into other careers. The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement informed the Board that over half of the graduate vacancies on offer today are for graduates of any subject discipline. The current career guides provided to each of the University's Schools do contain nuanced information and a powerful narrative informing students that it is their 'graduateness', the skills, the capabilities, the experience they are able to offer as a graduate, are as important as their subject domain knowledge.
- Governors also asked whether there is a platform to support and encourage employers to offer jobs to graduates. The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement advised that this is done through a product licensed through the Higher Education Careers Service Unit called 'My jobs and placements' (also known as Prospects) which is free for students and employers. Last year the University averaged between 90 and 95 new vacancies per week going onto the site. Also, alongside the new digital 24/7 careers zone the University now has access to jobs from 'Indeed', one of the biggest recruitment agencies for the UK and around the world. The University will continue to encourage students to register with those sites.
- Governors noted that the survey took place within six months of a graduate leaving the University and that this is a very short time in which to assess what success is taking place. Governors felt a longitudinal study would give a better understanding over a longer period of time at what point in a student's career they would progress. The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement advised that the survey is currently under review and reform with the likelihood of the survey being carried out in the future by a third party, rather than the individual universities and that the fixed census point of six months will be extended to possibly 12 to 15 months, giving graduates a longer period in which to settle into a career path of slightly more substance.
- The Chair noted that there was a time lag in regard to the information provided and therefore not helpful with forward

planning. He sought further clarification as to whether the University is aware of the current position in relation to graduation employment, whether it is positive, and whether the University is taking the appropriate actions to improve and to be as competitive as the University can be. The Director of Graduate Advancement & Employer Engagement informed the Board that he feels the University is making positive progress and that it has the right tools in place to make a real difference, for example, records from 2016 show that the well supported approach to improve post graduate study has increased from approximately 250 to 400. The 150 increase year on year accounts for about 5% in the positive towards the University's graduate prospects score.



- The Chair requested that the Board be kept informed of progress, or of any evidence that LJMU is falling behind its competitors.

Noted

LJMU 16.60 **Health & Safety (Standard Item)**

- No items raised.

LJMU 16.61 **Year End Annual Reports to HEFCE**

Received: (i) Quality Assurance – The Role of Governing Bodies:
The report of the Head of Academic Quality Services
(LJMU 16/055)

- Reported:**
- The report informed the Board of Governors of HEFCE's 'Revised operating model for quality assessment' and the role of the governing body to provide assurance to HEFCE about the quality of the University's Higher Education provision.
 - It was noted that in 2015-2016, the Board of Governors received overarching assurances on academic standards

and the quality of students' learning opportunities through the successful outcome of the Higher Education Review by the QAA in February 2016.

- The Board noted the report and accompanying action plan relating to the continuous improvement of the student academic experiences and student outcomes.
- The Board noted the methodologies used as a basis to improve the students' academic experience and student outcomes and agreed, to the best of their knowledge, that the methodologies are robust and appropriate.
- The Board also noted that the report provided the assurance to enable the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive to sign Part 2 of the Annual Assurance Return to HEFCE which is referred to later in the minutes.

Commented:

- The Pro-Vice-Chancellor informed the Board that it was fortunate that the University had undergone a recent QAA assessment which had provided a broad, overarching, external validation of the University's quality standards.
- The Deputy Clerk to the Board suggested that as the report is an assurance report to HEFCE that going forward the report should be presented to the Audit Committee at its October/November cycle in alignment with other assurance reports to the Audit Committee.

Agreed

(ii) Internal Control Effectiveness Statement:

Received: The report of the Deputy Clerk to the Board (LJMU 16/056)

- Reported:**
- The Internal Control Effectiveness Statement forms part of the suite of regulatory returns to HEFCE assuring stakeholders and regulators of the framework of prudent and effective controls in place throughout the University to ensure risks may be assessed and managed.
 - The statement was presented to the Audit Committee on 12th October 2016, and amended taking cognisance of the views of the Audit Committee, Internal Auditors and External Auditors. The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive then signed the return which is presented to the Board today.
 - The internal control processes have been added to the financial statements as part of the Corporate Governance

Statement and the Board was assured that such systems have been in place throughout the year ended 31st July 2016 and up to the date of approval of the financial statements today.

Noted.

(iii) Financial Statements 2015/16

Received: The report of the Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive (LJMU 16/057)

Reported:

- The report had been presented to the Finance Committee on 31st October 2016. The Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive also provided a handout which drew attention to the high level results for the Board's ease of reference.
- The financial headlines for the year are:
 - Group Surplus for the year £19.3m
 - Capital expenditure £21.9m
 - Income increase of 5.4% to £205m
 - Expenditure increase of 6.0% to £185.5m
- This year saw the introduction of significant changes to the reporting of Financial Statements across the sector. These come under the new Financial Reporting Standards 102 (FRS 102) and have resulted in changes in the manner in which the University must account for income and expenditure as well as the disclosure of its assets and liabilities including pension liabilities.
- The University is meeting all its banking covenants.
- 2015/16 has been a successful year for LJMU. Significant investment in the staffing establishment and infrastructure has continued to enable improvements in academic delivery. A surplus significantly in excess of budget has increased LJMU's net worth before pension liabilities. This, coupled with the ongoing delivery of the 2012-17 Strategic Framework and the development of the 2017-22 Strategic Framework places LJMU in a strong position to manage the challenges and difficulties facing universities in the light of the changing financial climate ahead.

Commented:



- The Chair thanked the Finance Committee for working through the detail of the Financial Statements and also the Finance Team for the work that had gone into putting the Financial Statements together to the satisfaction of the external auditors.

Approved:

- The Board approved the audited Financial Statements for 2015/16 for submission to HEFCE by 1st December 2016.

Received:

- (iv) The Representation Letter to the External Auditors (LJMU 16/058)

Reported:

- The Board received a copy of the Management Representation letter required by the external auditors and to be signed by the Chair of the Board of Governors.
- A report was presented outlining the assurances provided to governors throughout the year to enable the Board to state that to the best of their knowledge and belief all of the information submitted to the auditors is accurate, and that all material information has been disclosed to them.

Approved:

- The Board noted the report and approved the signing of the Letter of Representation by the Chair of Governors on its behalf.

Received:

- (v) Letter of Support for a wholly owned LJMU Company (LRC) (LJMU 16/059)

Reported:

- The Company is a wholly owned subsidiary of LJMU. The Company is a legacy company that was set up in 1993 to facilitate the building of the Avril Robarts Learning Resource Centre.
- The letter of support which was attached as an appendix is a document that the University prepares to assure the backing of the Company and its financial soundness.
- The letter of support will be duly signed by the Chair of the Board.

Noted and approved:

- The Board of Governors noted and approved the contents of the letter ready for signing by the Chair of the Board for submission to the external auditors.

Received:

(vi) Annual Sustainability Assurance Report (ASSUR) (LJMU 16/060)

Reported:

- The report updated the Board of Governors on the Annual Sustainability Assurance Report (ASSUR) which is to be returned to HEFCE as part of the annual returns, and to approve the rating of the KPIs for the fourth year of optional reporting.
- During the last twelve months the University has reviewed its sustainability and is assured that its academic and other strategies take account of the environment in which it is expected to be operating, and is taking the University in a direction where the Institution and its core publicly-supported activities should be sustainable.
- The ratings identified within the report had been endorsed by the SMT at its meeting held on 25th October 2016 and the Audit Committee at its meeting held on 9th November 2016.

Noted and approved:

- The ASSUR submission was noted and approved by the Board of Governors and will be signed by the Chair of the Board.

Received:

(vii) The Annual Report of the Audit Committee (LJMU 16/061)

Reported:

- HEFCE requires the Audit Committee to produce an annual report to the Board of Governors and the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive which must relate to the financial year and include any significant issues up to the date of preparing the report which affect the opinion of the Audit Committee. The report must include the Committee's conclusions on the adequacy and effectiveness of:
 - Risk management, control and governance;
 - Economy, efficiency and effectiveness (VFM);
 - The management and quality assurance of data submitted to the HESA, SLC, HEFCE, and other bodies.

- The Chair of the Audit Committee informed the Board that further work is being carried out to ensure audit actions and recommendations are completed and reported back to the Audit Committee in a timely manner.
- The Chair of the Audit Committee reported that on the basis of the information presented to the Audit Committee by the University management, Internal Audit, External Audit, and other sources, the Audit Committee's opinion is that the University's arrangements for the above are adequate and effective and can be relied upon by the Board of Governors.

Noted:

- The Board noted the Annual Report of the Audit committee.
- The Board noted the report will be forwarded to the Head of Regulation at the Funding Council and that the internal auditors' annual report, and the external auditors' management letter (and management response), will be included as appendices to the Annual Report.

Received:

(viii) Annual Assurance Return to HEFCE (LJMU 16/062)

Reported:

- The Annual Assurance Return to HEFCE confirms that the University's Accountable Officer, the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive, has met the obligations to HEFCE under the Memorandum of Assurance and Accountability.
- The Annual Assurance Return was presented to the Board in addition to a report that provided information on how the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive had received the assurances required to sign off the return.
- Part 2 of the return is new and the Board had received a report, minuted earlier at LJMU 16.61 (i), which provided the assurances required to sign this part of the return.
- Part 3 of the return will be signed by the Chair of the Board, on behalf of the Board of Governors, following the meeting.

Noted.

Received:

(ix) Prevent Duty Annual Monitoring Report (LJMU 16/063)

Reported:

- The Registrar & Deputy Chief Executive presented the first Prevent Duty Annual Monitoring Report outlining all activity undertaken in pursuance of the Prevent Duty since September 2015.

- The overarching report detailed where activity had taken place within the framework identified within the statutory duty and how effectively the University is meeting the requirements placed on it.
- The report also ensured that any areas of concern that had been identified during the previous two monitoring points had been incorporated into the work on Prevent and that progress is being made.
- The Registrar & Deputy Chief Executive informed the Board that the Internal Auditors, RSM, had conducted an audit review and had today provided the following statement: “Overall we are able to confirm the University has an appropriately designed framework in place for the delivery and monitoring of its activities in relation to the Prevent Duty. In addition to the conclusions of our own review, it is also evidenced by confirmation by HEFCE in response to the University’s Prevent Duty submission in April 2016”.
- The report contained the declaration of the Chair of Governors that throughout the academic year and up to the date of approval, Liverpool John Moores University:
 - Has had due regard to the need to prevent people being drawn into terrorism (The Prevent duty);
 - Has provided to HEFCE all required information about its implementation of the Prevent Duty; and
 - Has reported to HEFCE in a timely way all serious issues related to the Prevent Duty, or now attaches any reports that should have been made, with an explanation of why they were not submitted.

Noted and approved.

LJMU 16.62

Monitoring Forecast Report 2016/17

Received:

The report of the Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive

Reported:

- The Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive presented the report and presentational handout which provided an initial update on the 2016/17 financial year. The Monitoring Forecast Report had previously been presented to the Finance Committee on 31st October 2016. The Budget for 2016/17 is for a surplus of £7.0m. The

impact of pensions reporting under FRS 102 is assumed at £2.3m. It is assumed that no University fixed assets will be sold during the year, therefore the operating surplus is £9.3m.

- The monitoring forecast remains consistent with the approved budget.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- UCEA made a full and final offer for 2016-17 at the final negotiating meeting. The 1.1% base pay increase for employees on point 8 and above brings the average pay increase this year to 2.7% when combined with the pay progression available to around half the employees covered. Implementation of the pay award for all of the University's employees is expected to take place in November 2016.

[Redacted]

- A number of initiatives were identified to support activities that can have an immediate impact on enhancing the student experience and to support initiatives related to the National Student Survey.
- The latest Forecast for 2016/17 remains unchanged at £7.0m. The operating cost surplus remains unchanged at £9.3m. It is anticipated that the year-end cash position for 2016/17 will be £71m.

- [Redacted]

Commented:

- [Redacted]

Noted and approved:

- The Board of Governors noted and approved the continued actions taken by the Vice-Chancellor and SMT in determining the shape and future direction of the University as endorsed by the Finance Committee.
- The Board of Governors noted and approved the University's Monitoring Forecast for 2016/17 as endorsed by the Finance Committee.

LJMU 16.63

Risk Register

Received:

The report of the Director of Strategic Planning (LJMU 16/065)

Reported:

- The October 2016 risk register was presented to the Committee for oversight and review. The risk register had previously been reported to the Audit Committee at its November meeting.

- Two risks had been added. First, Brexit in the context of the referendum result in June which has created risks across the University's activity base – from staff and student recruitment, to research funding and overseas collaboration. Secondly, the Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) which will provide a major reputational reference point, and in future dictate the University's capacity to raise its UG H/EU fees.

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

- A risk appetite statement and table were drawn up during spring 2016 in response to a recommendation from the Risk Maturity Audit that risk tolerance should be defined at a more granular level. Further to a discussion at the follow-up audit, risk appetite has also been defined at the level of the individual risk, and this is expressed as a target risk score. The target risk should be taken to represent an acceptable level of residual risk once all actions have been completed.
- Work has also taken place with Faculties during summer 2016 to renew local risk registers, and to present them in a format consistent with the institutional version. The Faculty documents have now been recast (although they will continue to evolve), and a schedule has been established for the completion and submission of updates to inform the University-level process.
- In addition to the risk register the Board also received the assurance framework, indicating for each risk the fora in which the effectiveness of controls is tested, the information supporting this assessment, the positive assurances received, and any gaps in either assurance or control.

Commented:

- The Chair welcomed the excellent report from the Director of Strategic Planning.

Noted.

LJMU 16.64

Copperas Hill Update

**Secretary's
Note:**

[The Associate Director, Estate Management joined the meeting at this point]

Received:

An oral update from the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive

Reported:

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Action:

[Redacted]

Commented:

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Action:

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Agreed.

LJMU 16.65 **Update from the Executive**

Received: The report of the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive, the Pro-Vice-Chancellors and Deputy Chief Executive (LJMU 16/066)

- Reported:**
- The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive informed the Board of the recent sad death of an LJMU student.
 - The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive updated the Board on a number of key activities, collaborations and initiatives.

Commented:

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- Governors also sought clarification on the opening time of Sensor City which is anticipated to be June 2017 but yet to be confirmed.

Noted.

LJMU 16.66 **Student Issues**

Received: The report of the student governors (LJMU 16/068)

- Reported:**
- The report provided an update on the main issues and key campaigns from the students' union.
 - LiverpoolSU's Vice President, Academic Quality, ran a campaign to gauge student opinion about the TEF and the implications it could have on teaching quality and tuition fees. Although LiverpoolSU appreciate the limitations on the University with regard to government policy, the majority of students did not support the introduction of higher fees.

- As a result of a campaign attracting 5,596 votes, the students' union will be launching a number of activities to support the Student Health & Wellbeing Project.
- LiverpoolSU was pleased to note that the Minister for Local Government had refused Liverpool City Council's request that power to charge student landlords business rate be given directly to Liverpool City Council. The decision was made on the basis that it is recognised that student accommodation provides long-term residences for students, unlike the type of accommodation provided by hotels, and therefore it would not be appropriate to charge student landlords business rates.



- LiverpoolSU and LJMU have now entered into a Data Sharing Agreement which will assist with precisely targeted communications and engagement with students.
- The students' union has launched an initiative (Dragon's Den) for student groups to pitch an idea to a group of highly respected business people to win funding of £8k to spend on improving the student experience. The winning entry will be judged in February 2017.

Commented:

- The Chair welcomed the report and in particular the section on the work of the sabbatical officers noting the initiatives being carried out in partnership with the University.
- Governors clarified that the £8k reward for the Dragon's Den Initiative will be funded from the additional £250k provided to the students' union by the University.
- Governors welcomed the campaign to represent students in regard to the TEF noting that this may be in conflict with the University but recognising that this formed an essential part of the student union's campaigning responsibilities.
- Governors also welcomed the student union's renewed focus on fun activities for students.

Noted.

LJMU 16.67

FT Undergraduate 13 Month Retention Report

Received:

The report of the Registrar & Deputy Chief Executive (LJMU 16/068)

Reported:

- The report provided an analysis of the rates for newly recruited full time undergraduate students at LJMU withdrawing within 13 months of starting a degree course and the reasons for leaving.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- The report outlined the best and worst retention rates across the Schools and Faculties as per data based on data sourced from HESA Student Records.

■ The Report also provided a breakdown of leavers into three categories: Financial; Fail and Leave; and Other.

[REDACTED]

- The University will continue to focus on retention and closely monitor retention on a regular basis.

- [REDACTED]

Commented:

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- Governors welcomed the debate and would appreciate a discussion around financial hardship and ways in which the University can assist, even in the short-term. Governors felt that if students are leaving for financial reasons this should be considered very seriously by the University.

Noted.

LJMU 16.68

Annual Strategic Performance Report 2015/16

Received:

The report of the Director of Strategic Planning (LJMU 16/069)

Reported:

- The report presented the progress made against the University's Strategic Plan 2012-2017. The 2015/16 report, which is the final report against this plan in its current form, was presented in three parts:
 - The first setting out the University's performance against a series of headline indicators;
 - The second reflecting narratively on the University's progress against the core themes of its strategy, and priority activities for the coming period;

- The third providing a summary of the University's position against the Key Performance Outcomes (KPOs) associated with each strand of the strategic plan.



- Comparative scores against core education indices will come into sharper focus with the introduction of TEF, with its focus upon student satisfaction, graduate prospects and non-continuation.
- Looking back at the broader sweep of the University's progress over the last five years, it has come a long way: its scores in major rankings and assessments have seen a step-change, and it has a profile, reputation and traction that it previously did not. Equally, however, important areas continue to challenge it, and significant further energy will be needed if it is to realise its ambitions.
- The end of the five-year cycle provides an opportunity to reflect upon the DNA of a 'modern civic' institution, and to recalibrate what this should look like for the next stage of the University's journey in order to ensure its continued relevance, growth in stature and increasing impact over the period of its next strategic plan.
- The University's efforts to build upon its current position will take place in a challenging external context, characterised by contracting markets, political uncertainty and risks to funding and income streams.

Commented:

- The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive welcomed this important annual report to the Board which relates to the strategy and what the University has tried to achieve since 2012 and how the University is moving forward.
- Governors welcomed the excellent report which was clear and informative. Some governors felt that further reflection should be given as to the focus of the Board meetings and whether the Board is receiving the right strategic information. Governors particularly welcomed the focus and emphasis of the report which reflected on what the

University is doing, how it is taking control, and what it is planning for in the future.

- The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive welcomed the above comments reflecting that the contents of the report would set the agenda for the Board over the next 12 months.
- Governors noted the positive performance in the REF 2014 and the actions to improve its ranking through the next REF in 2020/21.
- The Chair welcomed the positive report noting that the University had made a lot of good progress.

Noted.

LJMU 16.69

League Tables 2017

Received:

The report of the Director of Strategic Planning (LJMU 16/70)

Reported:

- The report provided a headline analysis of the University's performance in the *Times and Sunday Times* Good University Guide 2017, the final UK table published during 2016; some headline reflections on the 2017 league table round as a whole: the key messages arising and the University's response; and a summary view of the University's performance in the key global rankings published during the last twelve months.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

- The *Times Higher Education World University Rankings* are published in September each year, and the 2016 table

ranked the University joint 58th in the UK. Globally, the University was ranked in the 501-600 category, equivalent to last year.

- Global league tables do not currently have the visibility of their domestic counterparts, and they provide a perspective on a relatively small fraction of the University's provision. Equally, however, they step outside national assessment frameworks such as REF, and provide a current and a genuinely international perspective on research quality and density (if not intensity).

- [REDACTED]

Commented:

- Governors felt the University shouldn't be too reactive and should be forging its own path rather than reacting to particular indicators. However, it was noted that the University needs to be doing both, pursuing its own strategy, but also taking account of and responding in a measured strategic way to external signals.

[REDACTED]

- [REDACTED]

- [REDACTED]

Noted.

LJMU 16.70

National Student Survey 2016

Received:

The report of the Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Education) (LJMU 16/071)

Reported:

- The report provided an up-date to the NSS 2016 outcomes report submitted to the Board of Governors on 29th September 2016. The report specifically related to some of the actions being implemented to enhance the student experience through the Faculties, Schools and Programmes, and therefore the Institution's performance in NSS.
- In order to evaluate the effectiveness of previous actions, principally the articulation of NSS Programme Improvement Action Plans, a detailed analysis of the impact on NSS outcomes of the Action Plan was undertaken for those programmes subject to plans in the 2014/15 and 2015/16 academic sessions.

■ The outcomes of the analysis confirmed that, at an empirical level, the NSS Programme Improvement Action Plans have had a positive impact on the NSS performance of programmes.

[Redacted text block]

[Redacted text block]

Commented:

- The Chair welcomed the report which focused on the actions taken by the University to improve NSS and Retention rates.

Noted.

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

LJMU 16.71 Academic Collaborative Partnerships Annual Report

Received: The report of the Registrar & Chief Executive (LJUM 16/073)

- Reported:**
- The report updated the Board of Governors on the criteria used in entering into an academic collaborative partnership and the due diligence activity undertaken to inform the decision-making process.
 - The report also listed the new partner organisations approved during the 2015/16 academic year.

- Commented:**
- Governors welcomed the report but would find it helpful to receive a paper outlining more detail about the partnerships and what they provide.

Action: Registrar & Deputy Chief Executive

- It was clarified that all the collaborations covered their costs and that the University did not incur any losses from its collaborative partnerships.
- Governors recognised the importance of collaborating with the right partners for the University and were assured that the appropriate processes are in place for continuous monitoring to ensure the partner organisations align with the University's strategic strategy and that the quality of academic standards are achieved.

Noted.

LJMU 16.72 Chairs' Briefings and Committee Minutes

- Received:**
- Draft Academic Board minutes of 29th June 2016 (LJMU 16/074) and 28th September 2016 (LJMU 16/075)
 - The Board of Governors' Workshop notes of 29th September 2016 had been emailed to all governors on 14th October 2016.
 - Draft Audit Committee minutes of 12th October 2016 (LJMU 16/076) and 9th November 2016 (LJMU 16/077).
 - Draft Employment Committee minutes of 17th October 2016 (LJMU 16/078).
 - Draft Remuneration Committee minutes of 24th October 2016 (LJMU 16/079 – Tabled).

- Draft Nominations Committee minutes of 24th October 2016 (LJMU 16/080)
- Draft Finance Committee minutes of 31st October 2016 (LJMU 16/081)
- Copperas Hill Steering Group minutes of 3rd November 2016 (LJMU 16/082 tabled).

Reported:

- The Chair of Audit Committee informed governors that the two meetings that took place in close succession discussed, in the main, the end of year assurance reports to HEFCE.
- The Chair of Audit also informed the Board that the Audit Committee had received a report on the proposed new business continuity arrangements and had approved the Business Continuity Policy and the Business Continuity Operational Guidance for staff.
- The Chair of Audit highlighted comments made within the minutes regarding the Internal Audit Annual Report 2015/16. At the time of drafting the annual report and the timing of the audit of the 'Governance Framework and Oversight – Copperas Hill Project', the report was with management awaiting comment and that the outcome of the audit will inform their 2016/17 annual internal audit opinion. The Chair requested that the report be shared with the Audit Committee members and members of the Copperas Hill Steering Group as soon as possible, noting that nothing critical was reported but that there are some "lessons learned" that can be taken forward before the next Audit Committee in March 2017.

Action:

Deputy Clerk to the Board

- The Chair of Audit also reported that the Audit Committee had received its first Value for Money annual report which is a new mandatory requirement for HEFCE.
- The Chair of Employment Committee informed governors that the Committee had had a full agenda, receiving the annual reports that fell within its responsibility.
- The Employment Committee had approved the annual pay award for staff, with the exception of senior staff which falls under the remit of the Remuneration Committee.
- The Employment Committee had also received, in advance of presentation to the Remuneration Committee, a report

outlining the review of senior pay arrangements for the Professoriate and Hay Groups.

- The Chair of Remuneration Committee highlighted the report received by the Committee in relation to the review of senior pay arrangements for the Professoriate and Hay Groups, which affects approximately 150 senior staff within the University. The key points of the discussion were around ensuring the PDPR process provides a robust and equitable process for assessing performance and that staff were fully trained in the process.
- The Chair of Remuneration Committee also informed governors that the Committee had agreed that the total costs of any performance rewards are bound and approved by the Remuneration Committee.
- The Chair of Nominations Committee outlined the key points of the minutes in relation to succession planning and the future recruitment of governors, taking into consideration ethnicity, disability, age, gender and the skills required at the particular time of a vacancy. The Chair and Deputy Chair had met with a prospective candidate this afternoon and will be recommending approval to the Nominations Committee in the first instance and then the full Board. The Chair will also be meeting a further candidate the following day and will provide feedback in due course, and a further possible candidate with financial skills is also in the pipeline.
- The Chair also informed governors that Sir Bert Massie had agreed to extend his term of office beyond January 2017 and that the Nominations Committee is in discussions about what that role might be and whether Sir Bert stands down as Chair of Audit Committee.
- The Nominations Committee had also approved amendments to the Academic Board's membership at the request of the students' union, namely that the number of student members be reduced to two from four members to free up more time for two Sabbatical Officers to enhance student engagement and the service the Sabbatical Officers provide to the student body, whilst maintaining a strong presence within the governance structure of the University.
- Given the discussions and presentations earlier in the meeting regarding the Financial and Monitoring Statements, the Chair of Finance had nothing further to add at this time.

- The Chair of the Copperas Hill Steering Group informed governors that the minutes of the last Copperas Hill Steering Group had been tabled and that a full discussion had taken place earlier in the meeting.

Noted.

LJMU 16.73

Membership & Governance Issues

Received:

- (i) An oral report from the Chair of Nominations Committee regarding the annual Attendance Policy. The Chair thanked all governors for their exceptional support and commitment over the last year, noting the valid reasons for non-attendance in some instances. The Chair also recognised the additional meetings and support provided by governors outside of the formal committee meetings, such as appeal hearings, the work of the Copperas Hill Steering Group, and attendance at corporate events. He informed governors that in the next annual Attendance Monitoring Report these extra commitments will be recorded to ensure fair reporting in the wider context.
- (ii) The Board approved the amendments to the Academic Board Membership and Terms of Office Policy (LJMU 16/083).
- (iii) The Deputy Clerk to the Board informed the Board that the annual reports of the sub-committees will be distributed in the near future.

Noted.

LJMU 16.74

Governance Effectiveness Review 2015: Action Plan

Received:

The report of the Deputy Clerk to the Board (LJMU 16/084)

Reported:

- The Deputy Clerk to the Board proposed that the action plan should now be discharged and that the Scheme of Delegation should be reviewed to align with the Strategic Plan 2017-2022, incorporating the following actions from the 'Governance Effectiveness Review Action Plan':
 - That the Scheme of Delegation be reviewed and updated, outlining the responsibilities of the governing body, the Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive, the University Secretary, and members of the Strategic Management Team.
 - A clear process will be implemented to provide assurance on external activities with significant,

institutional-level financial or reputational risks with clear lines of authorisation for approving such arrangements, including the circumstances where governing body approval is required, and will be added to the Scheme of Delegation.

- A clear process will be implemented for providing assurance that the board of any subsidiary entity possesses the attributes necessary to provide proper stewardship and control, necessitating the appointment of suitably qualified directors or trustees to its board, and requiring the entity's board to conduct its business in accordance with a recognised appropriate code of governance.

- That the Scheme of Delegation be approved at the Board of Governors' meeting to be held on 3rd April 2017.

Action: **Finance Director (University Secretary) & Deputy Chief Executive**

Approved: The Board discharged the action plan, noting the actions listed above will be added to the Board's Action Point Register.

LJMU 16.75 **December Workshop (Monday 12th December 2016)**

Reported:

- The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive informed the Board that a workshop will be held on 12th December 2016 at which the Executive will bring back some further proposals for the development of the University's Estate, and in particular around Copperas Hill.

Noted.

LJMU 16.76 **Any Other Business**

- The Vice-Chancellor & Chief Executive reminded governors of their invitation to the November Graduation ceremonies and to the Honorary Fellows' Dinner.

LJMU 16.77 **Dates of Next Meetings**

- Monday 12th December 2016 at 5.00 p.m. (Workshop)
- Wednesday 25th/Thursday 26th January 2017 (Overnight Strategic Event – at MacDonald Craxton Wood Hotel & Spa)

- Monday 3rd April 2017 at 5.00 p.m. in the Roscoe Room.